

## Racing Rules Committee Minutes



**The Racing Rules Committee met at 09:30 – 18:00 hours on Wednesday 5 November 2014 at Melia Palas Atenea Hotel, Palma, Mallorca, Spain**

***Please refer to the ISAF website [www.sailing.org](http://www.sailing.org) for the details of the submissions on this agenda/referred to in these minutes.***

1. Opening of the Meeting	1	8. ISAF Racing Rules Question & Answer Service	15
2. Minutes of the Previous Meeting	2	9. Racing Rules Committee Representatives on other Committees	15
3. Development of the Racing Rules of Sailing	2	10. Special Working Parties	15
4. Other Submissions	2	11. Annual Report	16
5. The Racing Rules of Sailing	3	12. Any Other Business	16
6. The Case Book	13		
7. The Call Book for Match Racing & Team Racing	14		

### **Present:**

Bernard Bonneau (FRA) – Chairman	Bill O'Hara (IRL)
John Doerr (GBR) – Vice-Chairman	Andrus Poksi (EST)
Neven Baran (CRO)	Chun Qu (CHN)
Lance Burger (RSA)	Dick Rose (USA)
Jim Capron (USA)	Ana Sanchez del Campo Ferrer (ESP)
Luciano Giacomi (ITA)	Katsumi Shibanuma (JPN)
Kamen Fillyov (BUL)	Richard Slater (AUS)
Ulrich Finckh (GER)	Leo Pieter Steol (NED)
Rick Hatch (CAN)	Richard Thompson (GBR)
Marianne Middelthon (NOR)	Zofia Truchanowicz (POL)
Ricardo Navarro (BRA) (non-voting)	

Xu Lijia (CHN) – ISAF Athletes' Commission (non-voting)

Jon Napier – ISAF Competitions Manager

Madeleine Dunn – ISAF Competitions & Race Officials Administrator

### **Apologies:**

Shane Borrell (NZL)

### **Not present:**

Ricardo Lobato (BRA)

## **1. Opening of the Meeting**

The Chairman opened the meeting and welcomed the Committee to Palma. He thanked all the members of the Committee for their work over the year and in particular the members of the working parties.

The Chairman noted the new system for preparing the interim recommendations of the Racing Rules Committee Working Party and said the earlier production of the recommendations was a great improvement for the Committee as a whole. The Chairman thanked the Working Party for this development and said he expected improved contribution from the other members of the Committee now that the recommendations were available earlier in the year.

### 2. Minutes of the Previous Meeting

(a) Minutes

The Committee noted the minutes of the Racing Rules Committee meeting of Wednesday 13 November 2013 (as circulated and approved after the meeting).

(b) Matters Arising

There were no matters arising from the minutes not covered elsewhere on this agenda.

### 3. Development of the Racing Rules of Sailing

Following email correspondence earlier in the year, the Committee received a presentation from the Chairman on possible ways to make the Racing Rules of Sailing more understandable and competitor friendly. In his view, the fact that there is such a range of opinions on rules such as mark rounding and obstructions is proof that the rules are not workable and that, if judges and recognised rules experts cannot agree, then ISAF cannot expect sailors to understand the rules to the required level.

The Chairman went on to say that the rules have become too detailed to understand properly and some of the submissions this year demonstrated that point. ISAF should think first as competitors using the rules instead of race officials implementing them. He felt that ISAF should not worry about 'changing the game' if rules are deleted or simplified as the new 'game' might be better. ISAF should also consider whether the rules now refer to too many other documents.

The Chairman highlighted two possible areas for consideration in this area. First, ISAF could consider making the rules more user friendly and presentationally attractive. This could include having illustrations in the rule book, specific rule books for the various disciplines (windsurf, kiteboard, radio sailing, super yachts, match and team racing etc.) and digital solutions. ISAF can consider rewording the complicated rules to simplify their understanding and using illustrated cases instead of small rule changes.

Secondly, the Chairman suggested that a number of areas of rules evolution should be considered. This might include stopping redress and the use of discards, having one call book for all umpired racing, removing rules 16.2 and 17, the simplification of rule 18 by deleting rules 18.3 and 18.4 and using the America's Cup model of mark rounding rules.

The Chairman proposed that a working party be appointed to prioritise this work, draft ideas and concepts and identify what resources may be required for this work. If possible, submissions should be made for November 2015 to allow implementation in the 2017- 2020 edition of the RRS.

The Committee discussed the issue and agreed with the Chairman's proposals.

#### **Decision**

**The Chairman is to appoint a working party to progress the proposals. Members of the Committee interested are to contact the Chairman and identify the areas of work they can contribute to.**

### 4. Other Submissions

(a) Submission 012-14 – ISAF Anti-Doping Code – Regulation 21 from the Executive Committee

*Opinion: Approve (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain)*

## Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

*The Committee has found that some cross-references in the Code are inaccurate and recommends these are checked.*

- (b) Submission 036-14 – Betting & Anti-Corruption – Appendix 5 from the Chairman of the Constitution Committee

*Opinion: Approve with the following amendment (19 in favour, 0 against, 1 abstain):*

*Amend definition of "International Competition" to refer to Major and Recognised Events and to allow MNAs the option to apply the Code.*

2.10 "International Competition" means ~~an International Event~~ **a Major or Recognised Event** as defined by the ISAF Regulations **or any other event designated as such by a Member National Authority.**

- (c) Submission 037-14 – Misconduct and Discipline – Regulation 35.5 from the Chairman of the Constitution Committee

*Opinion: Defer (14 defer, 6 no defer, 0 abstain)*

*Consideration should be deferred pending CAS decisions. The criteria used to decide whether a report should be considered by ISAF or an MNA are unclear.*

- (d) Submission 038-14 – Misconduct and Discipline – New Regulation 35.10 from the Chairman of the Constitution Committee

*Opinion: Defer (14 defer, 6 no defer, 0 abstain)*

*Consideration should be deferred pending CAS decisions. The origin of the report needs to be clarified.*

- (e) Submission 039-14 – Misconduct and Discipline – Regulation 35.16 from the Chairman of the Constitution Committee

*Opinion: Defer (14 defer, 6 no defer, 0 abstain)*

*Consideration should be deferred pending CAS decisions. If approved, the submission should be amended as follows:*

A person who has had a sanction imposed on him by the Disciplinary Commission has the right of appeal against that decision to the ISAF Review Board. Any appeal must be lodged in writing with the Chief Executive Officer within 30 days **of being notified of the Commission's written decision.** ~~of the publication of the written decision of the Commission.~~

## 5. The Racing Rules of Sailing

The Committee considered the following submissions:

- (a) Submission 117-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing – Introduction

*Withdrawn*

- (b) Submission 118-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - New Definition Basic Principle

*Recommendation to Council: Reject (2 approve, 18 reject, 0 abstain)*

*Rule 14 together with Cases 26 and 107 are sufficient explanation.*

- (c) Submission 119-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - New Definition Boat

*Recommendation to Council: Reject (0 approve, 20 reject, 0 abstain)*

*The RRC WP will review the location and status of the Terminology paragraph and, if appropriate, prepare a submission for 2015. RRC WP will change 'boat' to 'vessel' for flag L and Blue flag in Race Signals and in the definition Mark.*

## Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

- (d) Submission 120-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - New Definition Competitor  
Withdrawn
- (e) Submission 121-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Definition of Interested Party, Conflicts of Interest and Rule 63.4  
Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (17 in favour, 3 against, 0 abstain):  
Accept Proposal 1  
Accept Proposal 2 edited as follows  
**Conflict of Interest:** A person has a *conflict of interest* if they may gain or lose as a result of a decision to which they contribute, or if they have a close personal interest in that decision. ~~An unacceptable conflict of interest will vary depending on the event and other circumstances as described in the ISAF Guidance to Assessing a Conflict of Interest for Race Officials.~~  
*Reject Proposals 3 to 8. The Committee supports the principle that a conflict of interest can be waived and requests that the Joint Working Party for Rule 69 and Related Matters develop detailed proposals and make a new submission in 2015.*
- (f) Submission 122-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - New Definition National Authority  
Withdrawn
- (g) Submission 123-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Definition 'Proper Course'  
Recommendation to Council: Reject (0 in favour, 20 against, 0 abstain)  
*The Committee supports the intention but the proposal requires further work.*
- (h) Submission 124-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - New Definition Race Committee  
Withdrawn
- (i) Submission 125-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - New Definition Vessel  
Withdrawn
- (j) Submission 126-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Use of 'flag' in Various Rules  
Recommendation to Council: Reject (3 in favour, 15 against, 2 abstain)  
*The submission is unnecessary. Rule 25.3 and Race Signals (first paragraph) are sufficient. The RRC WP will consider whether rule 25.3 can be improved.*
- (k) Submission 127-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 6, Introduction and Definition Rule  
Recommendation to Council 1: Approve with the following amendment (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):  
Amend Proposal 1 as follows:  
**Each competitor and boat owner shall comply with ISAF Regulation XX [insert number when known], Betting and Anti-Corruption Code. An alleged or actual breach of this rule shall be dealt with under Regulation XX. It shall not be grounds for a protest and rule 63.1 does not apply. However, any person may report an alleged breach on the ISAF Betting and Anti-Corruption Hotline [insert phone number when known].**

## Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

Recommendation to Council 2: The Committee supports an urgent rule change with effect from 1 January 2015 as provided by Regulation 28.1.2 (19 in favour, 0 against, 1 abstain)

- (l) Submission 128-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Part 2 - Preamble

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (12 in favour, 6 against, 2 abstain):

Amend the first paragraph to read:

The rules of Part 2 apply between boats that are sailing in or near the racing area and intend to race, are racing, or have been racing. However, a boat not racing shall not be penalized for breaking one of these rules, except **rule 14 when the incident resulted in injury or serious damage, or rule 24.1, ~~rule 24.1 or under rule 14 when she has caused injury or serious damage.~~**

- (m) Submission 129-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 11.5

Recommendation to Council: Reject (0 in favour, 20 against, 0 abstain)

Unnecessary given the Committee's approval of 135-14.

- (n) Submission 130-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 18.2(c)

Withdrawn

- (o) Submission 131-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 20.1

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (15 in favour, 4 against, 1 abstain):

### 20.1 Hailing

~~When approaching an obstruction, a~~ A boat may hail **for room to tack and avoid a boat on the same tack, but only if the hailing boat is for room to tack and avoid her a boat on the same tack.** ~~However, she shall not hail unless if~~

(a) **she is approaching an obstruction and will soon need to make a substantial course change to avoid it safely, and** ~~she can avoid the obstruction safely without making a substantial course change,~~

(b) **she is** sailing below close-hauled **or above,** ~~or,~~

~~(c) the obstruction is a mark and a boat that is fetching it would be required to respond and change course.~~

**In addition, However, she shall not hail if the obstruction is a mark and a boat that is fetching it would be required to change course as a result of the hail.**

- (p) Submission 132-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 21

Recommendation to Council: Approve (19 in favour, 0 against, 1 abstain)

- (q) Submission 133-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 21

Withdrawn

- (r) Submission 134-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - New Rule 30.3

Recommendation to Council: Reject (0 in favour, 20 against, 0 abstain)

Prefer 135-14.

## Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

- (s) Submission 135-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rules 30.3, 30.4, A5, A11, D2.1, L11.5

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain)

*Italicize the word 'mark'. The RRC WP to make consequential edits to the RRS, including adding flag U to Race Signals.*

- (t) Submission 136-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 32

Recommendation to Council: Reject (0 in favour, 20 against, 0 abstain)

*Undesirable and unnecessary duplication. The RRC WP will prepare new submission to make clear that an error in starting procedure may be a reason for abandoning a race but not for shortening it.*

- (u) Submission 137-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 32.2(b)

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):

~~(b) at a line boats are required to cross at the end of each lap by the sailing instructions, that line~~

**(b) a line the course requires boats to cross; or**

- (v) Submission 138-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 33

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):

- (a) If the direction of the leg will be changed, the signal shall be the display of flag C with repetitive sounds ~~and either~~ **with and one or both of**

(1) the new compass bearing, ~~and/or~~

(2) a green triangle for a change to starboard or a red rectangle for a change to port.

- (w) Submission 139-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 36

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (12 in favour, 3 against, 5 abstain):

- (a) prohibit a boat from competing unless she has broken rule 30.3; **or**

- (x) Submission 140-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Part 4 Preamble, Rule C2.12, Appendix L 4.3

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (17 in favour, 0 against, 3 abstain):

Accept Proposals 1 and 2

Amend Proposal 3:

Amend rule C2.12 as follows:

~~Add to the preamble of Part 4: 'Rule 42 shall also apply between from the warning and preparatory signals until the boat stops racing. Rule 42 shall also apply between the warning and preparatory signals.'~~

## Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

*The RRC WP may edit if necessary.*

*Amend Proposal 4:*

L4.3 When flag Y is displayed ashore, **the requirements of** rule 40 ~~applies~~ **shall apply** at all times while afloat. ~~This changes the Part 4 preamble.~~

*RRC WP will consider moving this requirement into rule 40.*

(y) Submission 141-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 49.2

*Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):*

49.2 When lifelines are required by the class rules or **any other rule** ~~the sailing instructions, they shall be taut, and~~ competitors shall not position any part of their torsos outside them, except briefly to perform a necessary task. On boats equipped with upper and lower lifelines, a competitor sitting on the deck facing outboard with his waist inside the lower lifeline may have the upper part of his body outside the upper lifeline. **Unless the a class rule rules or any other rule specifies applicable specify a maximum deflection, lifelines shall be taut.** If the class rules do not specify the material or minimum diameter of lifelines, they shall comply with the corresponding specifications in the ISAF Offshore Special Regulations.

(z) Submission 142-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 55

*Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (15 in favour, 3 against, 2 abstain):*

A competitor shall not intentionally put trash in the water. **Penalties for a breach of this rule shall be at the discretion of the protest committee. The penalty for a breach of this rule may be less than disqualification.**

(aa) Submission 143-14- Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 60.2

*Recommendation to Council: Reject (5 in favour, 15 against, 0 abstain)*

*It is unacceptable to allow a race committee to cancel an entry as a result of a technical breach.*

(bb) Submission 144-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 61.1.1(a)(4)

*Recommendation to Council: Approve (14 in favour, 3 against, 3 abstain)*

(cc) Submission 145-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rules 61, Appendix F - Tangles

*Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (19 in favour, 0 against, 1 abstain):*

**(d) when a kiteboard first breaks a rule of part 2 and, as a result, causes a tangle for which redress is given, she shall be scored RCT if she retired or DCT if she is disqualified. When she does this a second or subsequent time in the series, she shall be scored DNE (disqualification not excludable).**

*The RRC WP to edit in conjunction with Board Rules WP.*

(dd) Submission 146-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 61.1(b), Appendix L 16.4

*Withdrawn*



## Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

- (ee) Submission 147-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 61.2  
Withdrawn
- (ff) Submission 148-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 62.1  
Recommendation to Council: Approve (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain)
- (gg) Submission 149-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 63.3(a)  
Recommendation to Council: Approve (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain)
- (hh) Submission 150-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 63.4  
Recommendation to Council: Reject (0 in favour, 18 against, 2 abstain)  
*The RRC WP will prepare a 2015 submission making the change in Appendix P.*
- (ii) Submission 151-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 63.7  
Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (13 in favour, 3 against, 4 abstain):  
*Approve Proposal 1 and reject Proposal 2. The RRC WP to edit as necessary.*
- (jj) Submission 152-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 64.3(c)  
Recommendation to Council: Approve (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):
- (kk) Submission 153-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 66, Appendix L16.7  
Recommendation to Council: Approve (12 in favour, 6 against, 1 abstain)
- (ll) Submission 154-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 69  
Recommendation to Council: Defer (20 defer, 0 no defer, 0 abstain)
- (mm) Submission 155-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 71 and Appendix R  
Withdrawn
- (nn) Submission 156-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rules 78.2, A5 and J2.2(19) and Appendices L and LE  
Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (16 in favour, 2 against, 2 abstain):  
*Accept Proposal 1 amended as follows:*  
**78.2** When a *rule* requires a valid certificate to be produced or its existence verified before a boat *races*, and this cannot be done, the boat may *race* provided that the race committee receives a statement signed by the person in charge that the boat has a valid certificate. **The boat shall produce the certificate or arrange for its existence to be verified by the race committee before the scheduled time of the warning signal for the first race on the last day of the event. The race committee shall extend the time if there is good reason to do so.** **The penalty for breaking this rule is disqualification without a hearing** ~~If the certificate is not produced or verified before the end of the event, the boat shall be disqualified from all races of the event.~~  
*Accept Proposal 2 and add a reference to rule 78.2 to rule 63.1.*  
*Reject Proposals 3 and 4.*
- (oo) Submission 157-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 85



## Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):

The organizing authority, race committee, ~~equipment inspector, measurer for an event~~ and protest committee **and other race officials** shall be governed by the rules in the conduct and judging of races.

- (pp) Submission 158-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 86.1(a)

Recommendation to Council: Approve (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain)

- (qq) Submission 159-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 86.1(c)

Recommendation to Council: Reject (1 in favour, 19 against, 0 abstain)

The submission is unnecessary. Rule G5 permits ISAF Classes to change Appendix G with ISAF approval and rule G2 permits other classes to do so. Appendix G takes precedence over rule 86.1 as stated in the RRS Introduction.

- (rr) Submission 160-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 90.2(a)

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (17 in favour, 2 against, 1 abstain)

Do not amend rule 90.2 but locate the added words in the Preambles to Appendices J, K, L and LE. Extra words are advice, not a rule.

- (ss) Submission 161-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 90.3

Recommendation to Council: Reject (1 in favour, 19 against, 0 abstain)

The submission is unnecessary. See relevant rules in Appendix A.

- (tt) Submission 162-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule 91

Recommendation to Council: Approve (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain)

- (uu) Submission 163-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Re-order Appendix B Rules

Recommendation to Council: Approve (19 in favour, 1 against, 0 abstain)

- (vv) Submission 164-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule Numbering Appendix B

Recommendation to Council: Approve (18 in favour, 1 against, 1 abstain)

- (ww) Submission 165-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Appendix B, Definition 'About to Round or Pass', Rule B2.18

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (18 in favour, 0 against, 2 abstain)

Approve Proposal 1 amended as follows:

~~**About to Round or Pass** A board is about to round or pass a mark when her proper course is to begin to manoeuvre to round or pass it, until the mark is rounded or passed.~~ **Rounding or Passing** A board is rounding or passing a mark from the time when her proper course is to begin to manoeuvre to round or pass it, until the mark has been rounded or passed.

Approve Proposal 2 amended as follows:

Rule 18 ~~begins to~~ **applies** between boards when they are required to leave a mark on the same side and at least one of them is **rounding or passing it** ~~about to round or pass it.~~ ~~The rule no longer applies after the board entitled to mark room has passed the mark.~~

- (xx) Submission 166-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Appendix B, Definition 'Beach Start'

## Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

- Withdrawn
- (yy) Submission 167-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Reinstate Rule B3.26  
Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):  
Approve with amendment of adding the following definition of a beach start as (a) in SYSTEM 3:  
**Beach Start When the starting line is on the beach, or so close to the beach, that competitor must stand in the water to start, the start is a beach start.**
- (zz) Submission 168-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule B5.62.1(e)  
Withdrawn
- (aaa) Submission 169-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule B10.29  
Withdrawn
- (bbb) Submission 170-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule B10.70.7  
Recommendation to Council: Approve (19 in favour, 1 against, 0 abstain)
- (ccc) Submission 171-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Appendix C - Match Racing Rules  
Withdrawn
- (ddd) Submission 172-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Appendix C Match Racing Rules, C2.9  
Recommendation to Council 1: Approve (15 in favour, 3 against, 2 abstain)  
Recommendation to Council 2: The Committee supported an urgent rule change as provided by Regulation 28.1.2 (14 in favour, 3 against, 3 abstain)
- (eee) Submission 173-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Appendix C Match Racing Rules, C2.14  
Recommendation to Council 1: Approve (19 in favour, 0 against, 1 abstain)  
Recommendation to Council 2: The Committee did not support an urgent rule change as provided by Regulation 28.1.2 (8 in favour, 11 against, 1 abstain)
- (fff) Submission 174-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - New TR Rule D1.1(e)  
Recommendation to Council: Approve (13 in favour, 2 against, 5 abstain)
- (ggg) Submission 175-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Appendix F Definition 'Clear Ahead, Clear Astern; Overlap'  
Recommendation to Council: Approve (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain)
- (hhh) Submission 176-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Appendix F Definition 'Looping' and F2.22.5  
Recommendation to Council: Approve (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain)
- (iii) Submission 177-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule F2.18, Appendix F Definitions "Mark-Room", "Zone" and "About to Round or Pass"  
Recommendation to Council: Approve (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain)
- (jjj) Submission 178-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Appendix F Definition 'Recovering' vs 'Capsized', Rule 23.2  
Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (18 in favour, 0 against, 2 abstain):

## Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

*Accept Proposal 1.*

*Accept Proposal 2 amended as follows:*

~~23.2 A kiteboard that is capsized or aground shall not interfere with another kiteboard.~~ **recovering shall keep clear of a kiteboard that is not other kiteboards.**

(kkk) Submission 179-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule F2.13

*Recommendation to Council: Approve (18 in favour, 2 against, 0 abstain)*

(lll) Submission 180-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule F3.31

*Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (19 in favour, 0 against, 1 abstain):*

~~Rule 31 is deleted.~~ **While racing, a kiteboard shall not touch the a windward mark.**

(mmm) Submission 181-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rules F3.29.1, F3.30.1, F3.30.2, F3.30.3

*Recommendation to Council: Approve (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain)*

(nnn) Submission 182-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule F4.44

*Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (19 in favour, 1 against, 0 abstain):*

*The RRC WP to edit as necessary.*

(ooo) Submission 183-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule F5.61.1(a)

*Recommendation to Council: Approve (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain)*

(ppp) Submission 184-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule F5.64.3(a), Class Rule Protests

*Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):*

*In Proposal 1, italicise "race".*

*In Proposal 2, amend as follows:*

**64.3 (b) ~~When a protest or request for redress relating to any matter concerning the measurement of a kiteboard, the interpretation of the class rule, or damage of a kiteboard is lodged with the protest committee, the protest committee shall refer the matter together with the relevant facts to an authority responsible for interpreting the rule and be guided by its advice. When the protest committee is in doubt about any matter concerning the measurement of a kiteboard, the interpretation of a class rule, or a matter involving damage to a kiteboard, it shall refer its questions, together with the relevant facts, to an authority responsible for interpreting the rule. In making its decision, the committee shall be bound by the reply of the authority.~~**

(qqq) Submission 185-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule F5.62.1(e)

*Recommendation to Council: Approve (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):*

(rrr) Submission 186-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - New Rule F5.70.7

## Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

Recommendation to Council: Approve (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):

- (sss) Submission 187-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - New Rule F.A.4.2

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):

**A ~~boat~~ kiteboard that did not *start*, did not *finish*, retired or was disqualified shall be scored points for the finishing place one more than the number of ~~boats~~ kiteboards entered in the series or, in a race of an elimination series, the number of kiteboards in that heat. A ~~boat~~ kiteboard that is penalized under rule 30.2 or that takes a penalty under rule 44.3(a) shall be scored points as provided in rule 44.3(c).**

- (ttt) Submission 188-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Appendix F.A.8

Recommendation to Council: Approve (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):

- (uuu) Submission 189-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Introduction Appendix J and New Definition Race

Withdrawn

- (vvv) Submission 190-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Appendices J, K and L

Recommendation to Council: Defer (14 defer, 5 no defer, 1 abstain)

*Submission to be reviewed as part of a package to present the RRS in a more friendly way.*

- (www) Submission 191-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Appendices J1.2, J2.2, L16.9

Withdrawn

- (xxx) Submission 192-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rules K18 and L27

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):

*Amend Appendix K, paragraph 18, and Appendix L, instruction 27 to:*

### **RADIO COMMUNICATION**

***Insert any alternative text that applies. Describe any radio communication bands or frequencies that will be used or allowed.***

**[18]**

**[27]**

***Except in an emergency, a boat that is racing shall not make voice or data transmissions and shall not receive voice or data communication that is not available to all boats.***

- (yyy) Submission 193-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Appendix K and Appendix L

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):

*Accept with acronym for notice of race changed to 'NoR'.*

*Amend Proposal 2, to also insert the new paragraph in the preamble to Appendix K and use 'x' instead of 'n' in 'RRS n', 'NoR n' and 'SI n'.*

- (zzz) Submission 194-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule L11.4

Recommendation to Council: Approve (19 in favour, 0 against, 1 abstain):

- (aaaa) Submission 195-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule L15.2

## Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

Recommendation to Council: Reject (2 in favour, 18 against, 0 abstain)

- (bbbb) Submission 196-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Appendix L16

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (18 in favour, 2 against, 0 abstain):

Accept for Appendix LE only, amended as follows:

**Include only if rule N1.4(b) will apply.**

**X.X**

**The time limit to request a hearing by panel composed in compliance with rule N1.1, N1.2 and N1.3 will be minutes.**

- (cccc) Submission 197-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule L20

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):

Subject to editing by the RRC WP.

- (dddd) Submission 198-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Appendix LE

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):

The Racing Rules Committee, **in conjunction with the Race Management Subcommittee**, shall have the authority to revise Appendix LE (Expanded version of the Appendix L - Sailing Instructions guide) from time to time.

- (eeee) Submission 199-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Rule N1.4(b)

Recommendation to Council: Approve (14 in favour, 2 against, 4 abstain)

- (ffff) Submission 200-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Appendix P

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (17 in favour, 3 against, 0 abstain):

If the class rules permit pumping, rocking and ooching when the wind speed exceeds a specified limit, the race committee may signal that those actions are permitted, as specified in the class rules, by displaying flag O no later than the ~~preparatory~~ warning signal and removing it no earlier than the starting signal.

- (gggg) Submission 201-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - New Appendix X, Arbitration

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):

The Committee accepts the principle of an experimental arbitration (or mediation) appendix located on the ISAF web site. Subject to editing by RRC WP.

## 6. The Case Book

The Committee received a progress report from the Chairman of the Case Book Working Party and then considered the following submissions:

- (a) Submission 202-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Cases 10 and 54

Recommendation to Council: Approve (16 in favour, 4 against, 0 abstain)

- (b) Submission 203-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case, Definition Keep Clear, Rule 16, 20.1

## Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

### Withdrawn

- (c) Submission 204-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case Definition, Mark-Room, Room, Rules 18.3, 21, 64.1(a)

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):

*Accept principle subject to substantial shortening by the Case Book Working Party.*

- (d) Submission 205-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case, Definition Proper Course, Rule 17

Recommendation to Council: Approve (17 in favour, 2 against, 1 abstain)

- (e) Submission 206-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case Based on Q&A J 004

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):

*Amend the third bullet point of the Answer as follows:*

~~*the tiller was previously in good condition*~~ *the damage was not due to the tiller previously having been in poor condition.*

*Add new Question and Answer 2 as follows:*

### Assumed Facts for Question 2

*Boat A does not keep clear of Boat B. There is no contact between them. Boat B has to manoeuvre to avoid potentially damaging contact, but in the process hits and damages Boat C, which loses places.*

### Q2. Is Boat C entitled to redress?

#### A2. Yes, provided that

- B's manoeuvre was made as soon as it was clear to B that A was not keeping clear,*
- the damage to C was the result of A not keeping clear and not the result of unnecessarily poor seamanship by B, and*
- Boat C could not reasonably have avoided the collision and resulting damage.*

## 7. The Call Book for Match Racing & Team Racing

The Committee received a progress report from the Chairman Match and Team Racing Rules Working Party and then considered the following submissions:

- (a) Submission 207-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Match Racing Call L10 and Team Racing Call L10

Recommendation to Council: Approve (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain)

- (b) Submission 208-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - New Case Based on Q&A J 010

### Withdrawn

*The Committee requests the Q&A Panel withdraw Q&A J 010 immediately.*

- (c) Submission 209-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Match Racing Call N9

Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (20 in favour, 0 against, 0 abstain):

*In last paragraph of Answer change 'rule 24' to 'rule 24.2'.*

## Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)

- (d) Submission 210-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Team Racing Call D2  
Recommendation to Council: Reject (0 in favour, 17 against, 3 abstain)
- (e) Submission 211-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Team Racing Call L8  
Recommendation to Council: Approve with the following amendment (19 in favour, 0 against, 1 abstain):  
*Subject to editing by the Match & Team Racing Rules Working Party in respect of the principle of the last point of certainty in Answer 1.*
- (f) Submission 212-14 - Racing Rules of Sailing - Team Racing Call M11  
Recommendation to Council: Approve (19 in favour, 0 against, 1 abstain)

### 8. ISAF Racing Rules Question & Answer Service

The Committee received a report from the Chairman of the Racing Rules Q&A Panel about the ISAF Racing Rules Question and Answer Service in 2014.

#### **Decision**

**The Committee approves the use of private answers to Q&As when deemed appropriate by the Panel Chairman.**

### 9. Racing Rules Committee Representatives on other Committees

- (a) Equipment Committee  
The Committee received a report from the Equipment Committee representative.
- (b) Equipment Control Sub-committee  
The Committee received a report from the Equipment Control Sub-committee representative.
- (c) Class Rule Sub-committee  
The Committee received a report from the Class Rule Sub-committee representative.
- (d) Race Officials Committee  
The Committee received a report from the Race Officials Committee representative.

### 10. Special Working Parties

- (a) The Committee received a report from the Competitions Manager on behalf of the Addendum Q Working Party and noted the intention to review the Addendum in 2015 in preparation for the Olympic Sailing Competition.
- (b) The Committee received a progress report from the Chairman of the Boards (Windsurfing and Kite) Rules Working Party and noted the submissions that arisen this year from its work.
- (c) The Committee received a progress report from the Chairman of the Appendices J, K, L, LE Working Party.
- (d) The Committee received a progress report from Chairman concerning the Special Rules Panel.

#### **Decision**

**The Secretariat is obtain reports from organizing authorities granted special rules dispensation.**



## **Racing Rules Committee Minutes (cont.)**

- (e) The Committee received a progress report from the Chairman of the Rule 69 and Judicial Matters Working Party.
- (f) The Committee received a progress report from Rule 42 Working Party.

### **11. Annual Report**

The Committee noted the Chairman's report to the Council meeting of 15 November 2013 on the activities of the Racing Rules Committee for the period 1 January to date.

### **12. Any Other Business**

There being no other business, the meeting was closed.